# IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

BARBARA DELUCA and DREW R. NAYLOR, on behalf of themselves and other similarly situated limited partners,

Plaintiffs,

v.

Civil Action No. 1:19-CV-10498 (LAK)

GPB AUTOMOTIVE PORTFOLIO, LP, GPB HOLDINGS II, LP, GPB CAPITAL HOLDINGS, LLC, ASCENDANCY ALTERNATIVE STRATEGIES, LLC, ASCENDANT CAPITAL, LLC, AXIOM CAPITAL MANAGEMENT, INC., DAVID GENTILE, MARK MARTINO, JEFFREY LASH, and JEFFREY SCHNEIDER,

Defendants.

AGREED PROTOCOL AND
[PROPOSED] ORDER GOVERNING
DISCOVERY MATTERS AND THE
PRODUCTION OF ELECTRONICALLY
STORED INFORMATION ("ESI")

The parties, by their undersigned counsel, hereby agree to the extent not unduly burdensome to prepare their production of documents in accordance with the below agreed-upon specifications:

#### I. Hard Copy Documents

All hard copy documents should be scanned and produced as black and white single-page, Group IV, 300 DPI Tagged Image File Format (.TIFF or .TIF) images with an image load file (.OPT file and/or .LFP file) and a delimited database/metadata load file (.DAT). Each TIFF image should be named as its corresponding Bates number. Original document orientation should be maintained (*i.e.* portrait to portrait and landscape to landscape). The database/metadata

load file should contain the metadata fields listed in EXHIBIT A. To the extent not unreasonably burdensome, all documents are to be provided with per document searchable text (.TXT) files that contain full text extraction. In the event a document is scanned into TIFF format, the text tile should contain that document's OCR text. Settings such as "auto-skewing" and "auto-rotation" should be turned on during the OCR process. OCR text files should be provided in a sell-identified "Text" directory. To the extent a document is redacted, the OCR text files for such document should be generated in such a way as not to include the redacted text.

Absent undue burden, the documents should be logically unitized (i.e., distinct documents should not be merged into a single record, and a single document should not be split into multiple records).

Each TIFF image should be assigned a Bates number that: (1) is unique across the entire document production; (2) maintains a constant length across the entire production (i.e., padded to the same number of characters); (3) contains no special character or embedded spaces; and (4) is sequential within a given document. If a Bates number or set of Bates numbers is skipped in a production, the producing party will so note in a cover letter or production log accompanying the production.

To the extent that the requesting party reasonably believes that a particular document needs to be viewed in color in order to understand the meaning or content of the document, the producing party agrees, absent undue burden, to reproduce such document in color, as single-page, 300 DPI, color JPG images with the quality setting 75% or higher.

# A. Metadata from Hard Copy Documents:

- 1. Production Number Begin
- 2. Production Number End

- 3. Production Attachment Range Number Begin
- 4. Production Attachment Range Number End
- 5. Confidentiality Designation
- 6. Production Doc Page Count
- 7. Custodian
- 8. Source
- 9. Volume

# **II.** Electronically Stored Information

Electronically Stored Information ("ESI") is to be produced as black and white, single-page 300 DPI Group TIFF files. The TIFF files shall be produced with a corresponding image load files (*e.g.*, .OPT file or .LFP file). Each TIFF image should be named as its corresponding Bates number. Original document orientation should be maintained (*i.e.* portrait to portrait and landscape to landscape). TIFF image files should be provided in a self-identified "Images" folder.

To the extent that the requesting party reasonably believes that a particular document needs to be viewed in color in order to understand the meaning or content of the document, the producing party agrees, absent undue burden, to reproduce such document in color, as single-page, 300 DPI, color JPG images with the quality setting 75% or higher.

The parties agree that Microsoft Excel files, Microsoft PowerPoint files, and similar files do not convert to TIFF images easily. As such, the parties agree that such files should be produced in their native format. The parties further agree that a TIFF or JPG placeholder bearing the legend "Produced in Native File Format" and an appropriate Bates number shall be inserted in the production. The native file shall be named to correspond to the Bates number of the

placeholder sheet. The metadata load file shall contain a link to the produced native file via data values called "Native Link." The Native Link values should contain the full directory path and file name of the native file as contained in the produced media.

The parties agree to provide metadata for the fields listed in the annexed EXHIBIT A to the extent such metadata is automatically generated in the ordinary course of business. The parties have no obligation to attempt to manually populate any metadata fields, except for the following fields:

- 1. Production Number Begin
- 2. Production Number End
- 3. Production Attachment Range Number Begin
- 4. Production Attachment Range Number End
- 5. Confidentiality Designation
- 6. Native Link
- 7. Other Custodian or Duplicate Custodian

# III. System Files

Common system and program files as defined by the NIST library (which is commonly used by discovery vendors to exclude system and program files from document review and production) need not be processed, reviewed, or produced.

# **IV.** Families of Documents

For any documents that contain an attachment (for example, e-mail), to the extent available, the following fields should be produced as part of the metadata load file to provide the parent/child or parent/sibling relationship:

# 1. Production Number Begin

- 2. Production Number End
- 3. Production Attachment Range Number Begin
- 4. Production Attachment Range Number End
- 5. Production Doc Page Count

To the extent a document is part of a "document family" with a combination of privileged and non-privileged documents, the privileged documents will be represented in the production with a placeholder TIFF or JPG image that bears the legend "Document Withheld as Privileged" or "Redacted." The TIFF or JPG image(s) shall be endorsed with a sequential Bates number.

# V. De-duplication

Removal of duplicate documents may be done for exact duplicate documents (based on MD5 or SHA- I hash values at the parent document level) and may be done across custodians and sources, as long as, to the extent feasible, all custodians who possessed a copy of the deduplicated document(s) are clearly identified in the "Other Custodian" or "Duplicate Custodian" field. The custodian associated with the first copy of a document processed will be considered the primary custodian for that document (the custodian who will be used as the basis for determining which other collected documents are duplicates). To the extent that in any subsequent productions additional custodians are identified as having possessed previously deduplicated documents, the producing party, to the extent feasible, should provide an updated "Other Custodians" or "Duplicate Custodian" field for the de-duplicated document.

A. <u>Handwritten Notes or Other Alterations</u>: If there are any handwritten notes, or any other markings, on a document, it shall not be considered a duplicate. Any document that contains an alteration, marking on, or addition to the original document shall be treated as a distinct version, and shall be produced as such. These alterations include, but are not

limited to, handwritten notes, electronic notes/tabs, edits, highlighting, or redlining. If such markings/alterations are made in color, to the extent feasible, the documents must be produced in color as originally intended in the ordinary course of business.

To the extent the producing party becomes aware that a document may have been incorrectly withheld from production as a result of the de-duplication process, it should notify the requesting party of such fact and produce the previously withheld document or file.

B. <u>Last-in-time Production</u>: A party may withhold from production wholly included, prior in time e-mails (also known as lesser included e-mails) and produce a single copy of the latest in time e-mail. For the avoidance of doubt, only e-mail messages where both the e-mail and its attachments are contained in the more latest in time e-mail message will be considered lesser included e-mail messages that need not be produced. If the later message contains different text (such as where the later message adds in-line comments to the body of the earlier message), or does not include an attachment that was part of the earlier message, the earlier in time message must also be produced. To the extent that an e-mail thread contains privileged communications, such communications can be redacted. If an e-mail thread contains both privileged and responsive, non-privileged communications, the entire e-mail thread cannot be withheld as privileged, but instead should be appropriately redacted.

# VI. Production of Database ESI or Other Files Not Covered

If a database or other source of structured data contains responsive information, the parties agree that they will meet and confer to determine a mutually-agreeable format for production of the responsive data.

# VII. Production of Audio and Video Files

If audio and/or video recordings are responsive, the parties should meet and confer to determine a mutually-agreeable format for producing the audio and/or video recording. Before meeting and conferring, the producing party will have information sufficient to identify responsive audio and/or video recordings.

# VIII. <u>Bates Numbering:</u>

Bates number and any confidentiality designation should be electronically branded on each produced TIFF image of ESI but should not be included in the extracted text of ESI. For documents produced in native format, the Bates ranges or beginning Bates number of the TIFF images of those documents shall be provided.

# IX. Redactions

Each redaction on a document shall be endorsed with the word "Redacted" or

"Redaction," with that word being included in the text provided for the document.

Alternatively, the producing party may produce a field in the DAT file denoting which documents contain redactions.

To the extent a natively produced document needs to be redacted because it contains information subject to the attorney-client privilege or any other privilege or protection from disclosure, the parties agree to meet and confer about the format for native redactions.

#### X. Privilege and Redaction Logs

A. For all documents withheld or redacted on the basis of privilege, the parties agree to furnish categorical logs which comply with Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5) and Local Rule 26.2(a). Each category listed on the privilege log shall include the following information on a categorical basis:

- 1. Description of the category in a manner that will enable other parties to assess the privilege claim;
- 2. List of sender(s), recipient(s), and copyee(s) of the privileged and/or redacted documents and any not privileged documents attaching a privileged and/or redacted document;
- 3. Date range of the privileged and/or redacted documents;
- 4. Types of privileged and/or redacted documents (e.g., Word, E-mail, Excel);
- 5. The basis or bases for the redaction and/or privilege;
- 6. Number of documents completely withheld;
- 7. Number of documents redacted; and
- 8. Number of documents included in all "document families" of the privileged and/or redacted documents.
- B. E-mails that constitute a dialogue between or among individuals (an "E-mail Thread") shall be counted as one document. Only the latest in time e-mail on each branch of an E-mail Thread must be included in the categorical log.
- C. Privilege logs may be produced on a rolling basis. The producing party shall provide the Privilege Log and supplements for each production within forty-five (45) days of each given production date.
  - D. Documents Presumptively Not to be Logged on a Privilege Log:
    - 1. Communications with internal or external counsel related to the Action after the commencement of the Action.
    - 2. Work product created in connection with this Action.

# **XI.** Redacted Documents

E-mails redacted for privilege shall not redact the Author, Recipients (including CC and BCC recipients), or Date.

# XII. Objections Preserved

Nothing in this stipulation shall be interpreted to require disclosure of information reasonably determined to be irrelevant or otherwise outside the scope of discovery under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(1), or relevant information protected by any applicable privileged or protection or to limit the provisions of Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(2)(B). The parties do not waive any objections as to the production, discoverability, or confidentiality of ESI, including, without limitation, objections regarding the burden, overbreadth, or relevance of document requests related to ESI, or relating to the production of ESI in a format specified in this stipulation.

# EXHIBIT A- METADATA FIELDS

Field Name	Description	Example / Format	
PRODBEG	The Document <b>ID</b> number of first	ABC0000001	
	page of the document.		
PRODEND	The Document ID number of the last	ABC0000003	
	page of a document.		
BEGATTACH	The Document ID number of the first	ABC0000001	
	page of the parent document.		
ENDATTACH	The Document ID number of the last	ABC0000008	
	page of the last attachment.		
CONFIDENTIALITY	The level of confidentiality assigned	Confidential, Highly	
DESIGNATION	to the document by Counsel.	Confidential	
PGCOUNT	The number of pages in a document.	Numeric	
1 0 0 0 0 1 ( 1	(image records)	1,0110110	
CUSTODIAN	All of the custodians / sources of a	Smith, Joe; Doe, Jane	
Cestobin	document from which the document		
	originated.		
SOURCE	Location where hard documents were	Joe Smith Office; HR File	
JOUROL	found at time of collection.	Room	
VOLUME	The name of the CD or Hard Drive for	VOL0001	
VOLCIVIE	ESI, or collection, binder, cabinet for	VOLOUUT	
	hard copy dots.		
EMAIL SUBJECT	The subject line of the e-mail.		
EMAIL AUTHOR /	The display name and e-mail of the	Joe Smith	
FROM	author of an e-mail.	<pre><jsmith@email.com></jsmith@email.com></pre>	
EMAIL	The display name and e-mail of the	Joe Smith	
RECIPIENTS / TO	recipient(s) of an e-mail.	<pre><jsmith@email.com>;</jsmith@email.com></pre>	
RECHIENTS/ TO	recipient(s) of all c-man.	tiones@email.com	
EMAIL CC	The display name and e-mail of the	Joe Smith	
	copyee(s) of an e-mail.	<pre><jsmith@email.com>;</jsmith@email.com></pre>	
		tjones@email.com	
EMAIL BCC	The display name and e-mail of the	Joe Smith	
ENTITE Dec	blind copyee(s) of an e-mail.	<pre><jsmith@email.com>;</jsmith@email.com></pre>	
	omia copyec(s) of all c main	jones cgemail.com	
RECEIVED DATE	The date the document was received.	MM/DD/YYYY	
RECEIVED TIME	The time the document was received.	HH:MM	
SENT DATE	The date the document was sent.	MM/DD/YYYY	
SENT TIME	The time the document was sent.	HH:MM	
EMAIL	ID used to tie together e-mail threads.	01 C72AC4C	
CONVERSION	zata to the together o main unounds.		
INDEX/THREAD TEXT			
TIME ZONE	Single time zone applied to	PST, CST, EST, etc.	
	processing of all documents and files.	151, C51, L51, CC.	
	processing of an accuments and mes.		
FILE NAME	The file name of a native document.	Dogument Name vis	
FILE NAIVIE	The the name of a native document.	Document Name.xls	

FILE AUTHOR	The author of a document from extracted metadata.	jsmith	
DOC TITLE	The extracted title of the document.	Table of Contents	
DOC TYPE	Native file application.	Microsoft Excel, Word, etc.	
FILE EXTENSION	The file extension of a document.	XLS	
FILE CREATE DATE	The date the document was created.	MM/DD/YYYY	
FILE CREATE TIME	The time the document was created.	HH:MM	
FILE LAST MODIFICATION DATE	The date the document was last modified.	MM/DD/YYYY	
FILE LAST ACCESS DATE	The date the document was last accessed.	MM/DD/YYYY	
FILE LAST SAVED BY	The last individual to save the file.	jsmith	
FILE LAST EDITED BY	The name of the last person to edit the document from extracted metadata.	jsmith	
DATE APPOINTMENT START	Date of calendar appointment entry.	MM/DD/YYYY	
TIME APPOINTMENT START	Start time of calendar appointment entry.	HH:MM	
DATE APPOINTMENT END	End date of calendar appointment entry.	MM/DD/YYYY	
TIME APPOINTMENT END	End time of calendar appointment entry.	HH:MM	
FILESIZE	The file size of a document (including embedded attachments).	Numeric	

FILE PATH/ ORIGINAL PATH	Location of the original document/ location in the ordinary course of business. This field should be populated for email and e-files.	Joe Smith/E-mail/Inbox Joe Smith/E-mail/Deleted items
MD5HASH	The MD5 Hash value or deduplication key assigned to a document.	
NATIVELINK	The full path to a native copy of a document.	D:\NATIVES\ABC000001.xls
FULLTEXT	The path to the full extracted text of the document. There should be a folder on the deliverable, containing	DATEXT\ABC000001.txt

Dated: February 8, 2021

### **GRANT & EISENHOFER P.A.**

# By:/s/ Daniel L. Berger

Daniel L. Berger Caitlin M. Moyna 485 Lexington Ave. 29th Fl. New York, New York 10017

Tel: (646) 722-8501 dberger@gelaw.com

Laina M. Herbert (Admitted PHV)
123 Justison Street
Wilmington, DE 19801
Tel: (302) 622-7000
lherbert@gelaw.com
Attorneys for Plaintiffs Barbara Deluca and
Drew R. Naylor, and the Putative Class

#### DILWORTH PAXSON LLP

Catherine Pratsinakis (Admitted PHV)
Jessica L. Titler-Lingle (Admitted PHV)
1500 Market Street, Suite 3500E
Philadelphia, PA 19102
Tel: (215) 575-7013
cpratsinakis@dilwothlaw.com
Attorneys for Plaintiffs Barbara Deluca and
Drew R. Naylor, and the Putative Class

# ROSENFELD & KAPLAN, LLP

# By:/s/ Steven M. Kaplan

Tab K. Rosenfeld (TR 9212) Steven M. Kaplan Nicole E. Meyer (NM 2302) 1180 Avenue of the Americas

Suite 1920 New York, New York 10036

Tel: (212) 682-1400 tab@rosenfeldlaw.com

Attorneys for Defendants GPB Automotive Portfolio. LP, GPB Holdings II, LP, and GPB

Capital Holdings, LLC

## **KOBRE & KIM LLP**

#### By:/s/ Leif T. Simonson

Leif T. Simonson 800 Third Avenue

New York, New York 10022 Telephone: (212) 488-1248 leif.simonson@kobrekim.com

Attorneys for Defendant David Gentile

# **GALBRAITH LAW FIRM**

By:/s/ Kevin Galbraith
Kevin Galbraith
236 W 30th St.
New York, NY 10001
Telephone: (212) 203-1249
kevin@galbraithlawfirm.com
Attorneys for Defendant Jeffrey Lash

IT IS SO ORDERED this	day of 2021:	
	/s/ Lewis A. Kaplan /BT	February 9, 2021
	HON. LEWIS A. KAPLAN, U.S.D.J.	